



**English Language Arts
Grade 8
Fall 2006
Response to the
Paired Reading Selections
Released Item #22
Scoring Guide**



1B: RESPONSE TO THE PAIRED READING SELECTIONS

DIRECTIONS:

Think about *both* of the selections in Part 1A as you answer the following question. You may look back at the selections as often as needed.

22 Is it always best to be part of a group? Yes or No?

Explain your answer using specific details and examples from *both* "Song of Masfield" and "The Daisy." Be sure to show how the two selections are alike or connected.

Use the checklist on the next page to help you with your response. The Notes/Planning space may be used for writing down and organizing your ideas.

Your response must be written in the lined spaces starting on page 3 of your **Answer Document**. Only the writing in your **Answer Document** will be scored. No additional sheets may be used.

You may not use any resource materials (dictionaries, grammar books, spelling books, etc.) for any part of this test.

PART 1B: CHECKLIST FOR THE RESPONSE TO THE PAIRED READING SELECTIONS

DIRECTIONS:

Use this checklist to help you with your response. Your response must be written in the lined spaces starting on page 3 of your **Answer Document**.

CHECKLIST:

- _____ Do I take a position and clearly answer the question I was asked?
- _____ Do I support my answer with specific examples and details from *both* reading selections?
- _____ Do I show how the two reading selections are alike or connected?
- _____ Is my response complete?

NOTES/PLANNING

Michigan Educational Assessment Program

Rubric for the Response to the Paired Reading Selections

Grades 3–8

Here is an explanation of what scorers think about as they score this writing:

- 6** The student clearly and effectively chooses key or important ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a clear connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are thoroughly developed with appropriate examples and details. There are no misconceptions about the reading selections. There are strong relationships among ideas. Mastery of language use and writing conventions contributes to the effect of the response.
- 5** The student makes meaningful use of key ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a clear connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are well developed with appropriate examples and details. Minor misconceptions may be present. Relationships among ideas are clear. The language is controlled, and occasional lapses in writing conventions are hardly noticeable.
- 4** The student makes adequate use of ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are supported by examples and details. Minor misconceptions may be present. Language use is correct. Lapses in writing conventions are not distracting.
- 3** The student takes a clear position on the question. The response makes adequate use of ideas from one reading selection **or** partially successful use of ideas from both reading selections to support the position. The position is developed with limited use of examples and details. Misconceptions may indicate only a partial understanding of the reading. Language use is correct but limited. Incomplete mastery over writing conventions may interfere with meaning some of the time.
- 2** The student takes a clear position on the question. There is partially successful use of ideas from one reading selection **or** minimal use of ideas from both reading selections to support the position. The position is underdeveloped. Major misconceptions may indicate minimal understanding of the reading. Limited mastery over writing conventions may make the writing difficult to understand.
- 1** The student takes a position on the question but only makes minimal use of ideas from one reading selection **or** the student attempts to support an unclear position with minimal use of ideas from both reading selections. Ideas are not developed and may be unclear. Major misconceptions may indicate a lack of understanding of the reading. Lack of mastery over writing conventions may make the writing difficult to understand.

Condition codes for unratable papers (zeroes):

A – Off Topic

B – Written in a Language other than English or Illegible

C – Blank or Refusal to Respond

D – Retells or references the reading selections with no connection to the scenario question or theme

E – Responds to the scenario question with no reference to either of the reading selections

Anchor Paper 1

The Song of Masefield is about
a horse that wanted to sing
like canines but he sang like a
horse. The ~~Pasie~~ couldn't song
but admired the song.

**Anchor Paper 1
Score Point D**

The student references the reading selections with no connection to the question. ("The Song of Masefield is about a horse that wanted to sing like canines but he sang like a horse.")

Anchor Paper 2

Do you think that it is good to be part of a group? I think it is. I don't know about you but life would be really boring if you didn't have friends or a group to hang out with.

I wouldn't be able to stand having to sit inside and do nothing because I had no friends or a group to hang out with. Mostly because the only thing to do inside is hang around and watch t.v. and I don't like to watch t.v. that much. I would rather be outside skateboarding, BMX, and sometimes just go do something with my friends.

So like I said in the beginning there is no way I could live without friends or the group I hang out with.

**Anchor Paper 2
Score Point E**

The student responds to the question with no reference to either reading selection. ("Do you think that it is good to be part of a group? I think it is. I don't know about you but life would be really boring if you didn't have friends or a group to hang out with")

Anchor Paper 3

No, because there could be a group that does bad stuff. If masfield would have started his own group there would have been plenty of bullying going on in both groups

Anchor Paper 3
Score Point 1

The student takes a position. ("No, because there could be a group that does bad stuff.") While there is a reference to Masfield ("If masfield had started his own group there would have been plenty of bullying going on . . ."), the student has made only minimal use of ideas from this one reading selection.

Anchor Paper 4

No I do not think it is always best to be part of a group. I think that you should not always be in a group because just as in "The Daisy", the Daisy learn tha you do not have to always have to be in a group. Sometimes it is good to be alone

Anchor Paper 4

Score Point 1

The student takes a position ("No, I do not think it is always best to be part of a group") and makes minimal use of ideas from The Daisy ("... the Daisy learn tha you do not have to always have to be in a group. Sometimes it is good to be alone"). Ideas are not developed.

Anchor Paper 5

Yes it is good to be part of a group, because in Song of Masefield, he wasn't nice to any of the other animals. He didn't respect them. Then he tried to be like the others and realized that he is good just the way he is and that everyone is special in their own way.

Anchor Paper 5
Score Point 1

The student takes a position and attempts to support the position with vague references to Song of Masefield. ("Yes it is good to be part of a group . . . he tried to be like the others and realized that he is good just the way he is and that everyone is special in their own way.")

Anchor Paper 6

Yes it is better because two head is always better than one, the horses song didn't song that good until the end When they all sang together and how the bird was saying the flower was pretty When you are in the Group the Group might make a feel better.

Anchor Paper 6
Score Point 2

The student takes a clear position. ("Yes it is better because two head is always better than one.") The student supports the position with minimal use of ideas from both reading selections. Note that some students will treat the daisy and the bird as a group ("... and how the bird was saying the flower was pretty. When you are in the Group the Group might make u feel better."), which is acceptable.

Anchor Paper 7

Yes I think it is always best to be part of a group because I saw of. Masfield, Masfield is nicer and learns better when he was in a group. Also in the Tracy Daisy was more happy when people or other animals came to visit. So yes I believe it is always best to be part of a group.

**Anchor Paper 7
Score Point 2**

The student takes a clear position. ("Yes I think it is always best to be part of a group . . .") and provides minimal support from both reading selections (" . . . Masfield is nicer and learns better when he was in a group . . . Daisy was more happy when people . . . came to visit.") The student's position is underdeveloped.

Anchor Paper 8

No, it is not always best to be in a group because sometimes you need to do things alone/by yourself.

If you're in a group all the time you won't learn anything because one or two people could be doing all the work out of 5 or 6 people.

In the "Song of Maskefeld" it could be good to be in a group because sometimes you need help with things to do better.

In the story "The Daisy" it was good to be in a group too. If it wasn't for the other daisies the "special" daisy would of got cut down.

So actually I think sometimes you should be in a group and some times it's best to stay alone.

Anchor Paper 8

Score Point 2

This response includes a clear position that addresses both sides of the issue. Keep in mind that the prompt asks, "Is it always best to be part of a group? Yes or No?" Given that the prompt uses the word always, students can correctly address why it is good to be in a group and why it is not good. This student addresses why it is not good ("No, it is not always best to be in a group because sometimes you need to do things alone/by yourself") and why it is good ("In the 'Song of Maskefeld' it could be good to be in a group because sometimes you need help with things to do better."). There is only minimal use of ideas from both passages.

Anchor Paper 9

I believe that it is not always best to be part of a group. Sometimes it can be best and others it can't. In the song of Masfield it can be better to be part of a group and create something beautiful.

Masfield creates something beautiful by singing his own tune. He combines it with everyone else's special tune to make a beautiful song. In the daisy it is better to be your own person. Being unique saved the daisy from being cut.

I think being part of a group is not always best. Although sometimes it is. I think people should find their own "tune" and be a part of something great.

Anchor Paper 9
Score Point 3

The student takes a modified position and supports it with partially successful use of ideas from both reading passages. ("Masfield creates something beautiful by singing his own tune. He combines it with everyone else's special tune to make a beautiful song . . . Being unique saved the daisy from being cut.") The position is developed with limited use of examples and details.

Anchor Paper 10

No it is not always best to be in a group because in selection 2 the tulips are part of a group but get taken away while the daisy was safe in the grass. The two selections were alike because both main characters get help from a bird.

Anchor Paper 10
Score Point 3

The student takes a clear position on the question. (“No it is not always best to be in a group . . .”) The student provides a connection. (“The two selections were alike because both main characters get help from a bird.”) The student makes partial use of ideas from The Daisy. (“ . . . the tulips are part of a group but get taken away while the daisy was safe in the grass.”) The combination of a connection plus partial support from one passage earns the student a 3.

Anchor Paper 11

No, I do not think that it's best to always be a part of a group. Sometimes it's okay to be a part of a group. In the first selection "Song of Mosefield," Mosefield didn't belong to a group. He was a mean horse who wanted to sing well and only thought of himself. Then he got advice from a canary named Asbury. Asbury told him he had the ability to sing well if he would only sing like a horse, not a canary. So he did then he made friends and became part of a singing group with different animals. In the second selection "The Daisy", there was a daisy who felt that they weren't pretty enough to be sang to by a bird. In this story the daisy was not a part of a group. The daisy was far away from the other flowers. Until one day a Lark flew down and sang to the daisy. The daisy was so happy it realized how beautiful she really was. It now realized that it did not have to be a part of a group to be happy.

So being a part of a group is not always a good thing. Depending on how you feel about yourself decides if it's good to be a part of a group or not.

Anchor Paper 11
Score Point 3

The student takes a clear position on the question (“No, I do not think that it’s best to always be a part of a group.”) and supports it with partially successful use of ideas from both reading selections (“Masefield didn’t belong to a group. He was a mean horse who wanted to sing well and only thought of himself. Then he got advice . . . then he made friends and became part of a singing group . . .”). The student shows why the daisy did not need to belong to a group. (“It now realized that it did not have to be part of a group to be happy.”) The student does not provide a connection between the two reading passages.

Anchor Paper 12

No, it is not always best to be a part of a group. Being in a part in a of a group is sometimes good and sometimes not. In the story Song of Masefield, Masefield liked being in a group and singing with others. And not being mad and all alone. In the story The Daisey was not in a group and chose not to be in one. When she had that bird sing to her she was happy being alone, but when she saw the tulips being picked she felt bad for the flowers and was glad that she was not in a group. The two storys were alike because both were about singing and songs. Masefield wanted to sing and daisey loved being singed to. In the end I think that it is not always good being in a group.

**Anchor Paper 12
Score Point 4**

The student takes a position. ("No, it is not always best to be part of a group.") The student makes use of details from both Song of Masefield ("Masefield liked being in a group and singing with others. And not being mad and all alone.") and The Daisy ("The Daisey was not in a group and chose not to be in one. When she had that bird sing to her she was happy being alone, but when she saw the tulips being picked she felt bad for the flowers and was glad that she was not in a group.") to support the position. The student makes a connection between the two reading selections. ("The two storys were alike because both were about singing and songs. Masefield wanted to sing and daisey loved being singed to.")

Anchor Paper 13

I don't think it's always best to be part of a group. Some times when you're in a group, you are not thought of as an individual. In "the Daisy", the little daisy preferred to the other flowers as just tulips, or just peonies, they weren't recognized as separate. When you do belong to a group it should be with people who love what you love, for example, Masefield's new found friends in "Song of Masefield." Toward the end he gets invited to the waters edge, tons of different animals meet there at night to do what they love, sing. In both stories they had the passion for music, but they also learned things about themselves. Such as, Daisy should be grateful of where it lives, and its good to be itself, unlike the tulips who got cut and taken away. Masefield learned to not be anything but himself, that's how he found his ability to sing after all.

Anchor Paper 13

Score Point 4

The student takes a position ("I don't think it's always best to be part of a group . . . When you do belong to a group it should be with people who love what you love . . .") and makes a connection between Song of Masefield and The Daisy. Both the position and the connection are supported with examples and details from both reading passages ("In 'the Daisy,' the little daisy preferred to the other flowers as just tulips, or just peonies, they weren't recognized as separate . . ."). The second part of the position is supported with details from Song of Masefield. (" . . . Masefield's new found friends in 'song of Masefield' Toward the end he gets invited to the waters edge, tons of different animals meet there at night to do what they love, sing.") The connection ("they also learned things about themselves") was supported with details and ideas from both passages ("Daisy should be grateful of where it lives and its good to be itself . . . Masefield learned to not be anything but himself . . .").

Anchor Paper 14

No, it isn't always good to be part of a group. Masfield was a horse. He wanted to sing like a bird. He finally realized he shouldn't fit in but he should stand out. He had his own beautiful horse song but he wanted to sing like the lovely birds.

The daisy was a little flower that listened to a bird every day. One day it flew down and complimented her about her silver dress of petals. She realized she stood out from the tulips. She was different.

In the end the both found out what made each of them special. What made them stand out. They realized they should be themselves, not part of a group.

Anchor Paper 14**Score Point 4**

The student takes a position ("No, it isn't always good to be part of a group.") and supports that position with adequate use of ideas from each reading selection ("Masfield was a horse. He wanted to sing like a bird. He finally realized he shouldn't fit in but he should stand out. He had his own beautiful horse song . . ."). Examples and details help support the position. ("The daisy was a little flowers that listened to a bird . . . flew down and complimented her about her silver dress of petals. She realized she stood out from the tulips. She was different.") The student makes a connection. ("In the end the both found out what made each of them special. What made them stand out.")

Anchor Paper 15

I agree that it is best to be part of a group. without everyone, and everything, working together, there wouldn't be a world like it is today. For example, without bees and birds and other insects, there would be no flowers, because flowers have to be pollinated to be reproduced. This shows how nature works together for good. Let's say you were in an orchestra. with just 1 instrument, the band would be incomplete. Also, at a workplace, one person couldn't run a company alone. Each person has to have a certain job to contribute to the company.

Masefield wasn't very friendly. He wouldn't help other animals. He just thought he was better than every other animal. Masefield didn't realise that everyone + everything has to contribute. He figured this out when he got to be part of the chorus. Each animal had their own unique sound. When it was all put together, Masefield realised that it was wonderful to be in a group, and to all work together.

The Daisy had thought it was plain. It also thought that it didn't matter. What the

Daisy didn't realise was that each flower is unique. Without the variety and such of each flower, the garden wouldn't be as beautiful. The Daisy also thought that the Lark didn't think it was as beautiful as the roses, tulips, and peonies. The Lark visited those flowers. Until that day where the Lark came to see little Daisy, and sang to her. Daisy was just grateful to hear the sounds.

The two stories are alike because they both enjoyed singing. They were also very different because Masefield wanted to be better than everyone, but Daisy accepted herself and appreciated to be able to hear at all. They both finally realised that they are working in a group, and everyone matters.

In the end, I think Masefield and Daisy both realised the importance of everything. I am sure they learned to accept and love themselves for who they really are. I also think that they learned to work in a group with others. Usually, putting in group effort + working together is best.

Anchor Paper 15
Score Point 5

The student takes a position (*"I agree that it is best to be part of a group."*) and provides meaningful use of key ideas with well developed examples from Song of Masefield (*"Masefield wasn't very friendly . . . Masefield didn't realize that everyone + everything has to contribute. He figured this out when he got to be part of the chorus. Each animal had their own unique sound. When it was all put together, Masefield realized it was wonderful to be in a group . . ."*) and The Daisy (*"The Daisy thought it was plain. It also thought that it didn't matter. What the Daisy didn't realize was that each flower is unique. Without the variety and such of each flower, the garden wouldn't be as beautiful."*). Students can effectively treat the daisy as part of the group of flowers, as outside the group of flowers, or as part of the group of two, comprised of the Daisy and the Lark. This student makes two connections between the reading passages. (*"The two stories are alike because they both enjoyed singing . . . I am sure they learned to accept and love themselves for who they really are."*) Please note that this student's "singing" connection is valid, as Masefield enjoyed singing and the Daisy enjoyed the Lark's singing.

Anchor Paper 16

No, of course it's not always best to be part of a group! There are all kinds of groups, good and bad. But you don't have to be part of one.

Take the little Daisy, for example. She knew she was pretty, but not as pretty as all the other flowers. She didn't have gorgeous multi-colored petals and she wasn't in a crowd of flowers just like her. She was simply there, alone in the grass. But once she was told by the Lark that she was beautiful, she knew the truth from someone else's point of view.

And how about that Masefield? Some horse, huh!?! He thought he was the best thing in the world because he was a strong, beautiful, powerful stallion! He always acted so tough and mean, making other little animals cry or run away. He felt good. But no one knew his dark little secret: he wished he could sing as nice as the canaries. He'd practice long and hard, but he could never be as lovely as they were. (He wanted to be part of their group!) So when Asbury, the old canary, listened in on Masefield, he saw what that rude horse didn't see: his talent. That Masefield didn't know it, but he could sing.

wonderfully. He could sing like a horse!

"Song of Masfield" and "The Daisy" are both very similar. They're both about two misfits who want to be like everyone else when they don't see how nice they are already. But when they do find out how much talent or good looks they have, they feel lucky.

So no, it's not always best to be part of a group. No matter how popular or talented or unique, cool or outrageous or tough they may seem. You know, you've got all of that inside of you, too. You just have to find it.

Anchor Paper 16
Score Point 6

This concise response clearly and effectively uses key ideas from Song of Masfield and The Daisy to support a position ("No, of course it's not always best to be part of a group!") and to make a clear connection between the reading passages. Both the position and connection are thoroughly developed with appropriate examples and details. There are strong relationships among ideas. ("Take the little Daisy... She didn't have gorgeous multi-colored petals and she wasn't in a crowd of flowers just like her. She was simply there, alone in the grass. But once she was told by the Lark that she was beautiful, she knew the truth from someone else's point of view.") Mastery of language use contributes to the effect of this response. ("And how about that Masfield? . . . But no one knew his dark little secret: He wished he could sing as nice as the canaries . . . So when Asbury, the old canary, listened in on Masfield, he saw what that rude horse didn't see: his talent. That Masfield didn't know it, but he could sing . . .") The student makes a clear connection, using key details from both reading selections. ("They're both about two misfits who want to be like everyone else when they don't see how nice they are already. But when they do find out how much talent or good looks they have, they feel lucky.")